

Peer review evaluation report

This is to inform you that your name has been put forward by the Editors of *Maydan* to act as a referee for the enclosed paper. You are kindly requested to read it carefully and forward your advice to the Editors by e-mail. Your evaluation will be transmitted anonymously to the author of the article, and your name will be kept strictly confidential. We ask you to formulate your suggestions for changes in a respectful, explicit and detailed manner for the authors to be able to revise and improve their work. Moreover, we remind you that *Maydan* welcomes four types of contributions. For this reason, in your evaluation, consider that the enclosed paper may be published not only as a standard research paper but also as a working paper (on this, see our guidelines for authors). Please, fill in the following forms by highlighting the relevant items, writing any comments in the corresponding field, and adding free suggestions in the final paragraph. We appreciate your cooperation. Thank you!

About *Maydan*

Maydan is the first Italian journal of studies on the Arab, Semitic and Islamic worlds run by PhD students and graduates, whose main purpose is to encourage the production of first research articles by young scholars. The journal revolves around a broad conception of the Arab, Semitic and Islamic worlds, which includes the geographical areas of the Middle East, North Africa, the Sahel region, Caucasus, and Central and South-East Asia. In addition, the journal aims to explore the presence and experiences of the Arab, Semitic and Islamic Worlds outside the regions traditionally characterised as “Arab” or “Islamic” and highlight differences within these worlds. *Maydan* welcomes contributions focused on the connections between these areas and the globalised world’s political, economic, social, and cultural dynamics. The journal’s areas of interest include anthropology, archaeology, arts, economics, geography, history, law, linguistics, literature, philosophy, political science, religion, and sociology. Moreover, the journal aims to support a critical reflection on the concept of Area Studies, problematising culturalist approaches that reproduce an essentialist and colonialist vision of the Arab, Semitic and Islamic Worlds.

Maydan is published annually. The articles submitted to the journal are subjected to a double peer review process. The accepted languages are Italian, English, and French. The journal accepts contributions from PhD students, graduates, and master students from foreign and Italian universities.

Reviewer's name (for the Editors only):

Title of the paper:

Sent on:

Returned on:

1) Is the title well-chosen and adequate?

Yes ____ No ____ **Comments:**

2) Is the paper well-written and understandable?

Yes ____ No ____ **Comments:**

3) Is the paper well-structured and balanced? Are there any parts to develop or to cut?
Yes ____ No ____ If so, which ones?

4) Does the paper contain new ideas or results that have not been previously published?
Yes ____ No ____ Comments:

5) Is the paper clear in outlining its theoretical and methodological tools?
Yes ____ No ____ Comments:

6) Are there any important bibliographical references missing?
Yes ____ No ____ If so, which ones?

7) Overall evaluation:

Excellent - The article can be published as it is	
Good - It can be published after some revisions	
Improvable - It can be published after some major revisions as a research paper	
Improvable - It can be published after some major revisions as a working paper	
Weak - It is not adequate for publication	

8) Free comments and suggestions: